

1 Long-term phosphorus removal in Land Treatment 2 Systems: evaluation, experiences and opportunities

3
4 MARIA DEL MAR BATISTA SEGUÍ, TIM HESS, RUBEN SAKRABANI,
5 SEAN TYRREL

6 *School of Water, Energy and, Environment, Cranfield University, UK*¹
7
8
9

10 Excessive release of phosphorus (P) from urban wastewater into water bodies is a significant
11 environmental concern. Land treatment systems (LTS) have been used for the last 150 years as
12 a low cost, and low energy tertiary wastewater treatment. However their P removal capacity is
13 limited by soil adsorption capacity. Accurate P-removal lifespan prediction is needed to
14 provide confidence in this technology and to support long-term wastewater treatment planning.
15 This review outlines the history of LTS, describes the main P removal processes in soils and
16 critically analyses the research methods used to date to assess long term P removal in soil.
17 Finally, an assessment is made of the role that modelling tools can play in aiding our
18 understanding of P processes in LTS soils and in forecasting system longevity.

19
20
21 **KEY WORDS: phosphorus, soil, wastewater treatment, longevity, modelling**

¹ Address correspondence to Sean Tyrrel, School of Water, Energy and Environment,
Cranfield University, Cranfield, MK43 0AL, UK. E-mail: s.tyrrel@cranfield.ac.uk Tel: +44
(0)1234 758320

22

1. INTRODUCTION

23 The release of excessive soluble phosphorus (P) to water bodies is a significant global
24 environmental concern and the resultant eutrophication is one of the most common water
25 quality problems (Smith et al. 2006; Carpenter & Bennett 2011). The consequence of
26 eutrophication is the degradation of water resources by toxic algal blooms, excessive aquatic
27 plant growth, oxygen depletion, death of aquatic life, and consequent loss of biodiversity.
28 Together these water quality impacts can cause considerable loss of value of fresh water
29 ecosystems in terms of diminished recreational value and profit reductions of the tourist sector
30 (Carpenter & Caraco 1998) and increased water treatment costs. Pretty et al. (2003) quantified
31 the eutrophication damage in England and Wales to be around £155 million per year.

32 The sources of P in surface waters vary depending on each context, and they can be classified
33 as diffuse and point sources. The main diffuse pollution sources in the UK are natural
34 landscapes, agricultural fields, rural and urban surfaces, waste from non-sewered populations,
35 farm animals and, atmospheric deposition. The principal point sources are municipal and
36 industrial effluent. The total P load to surface waters in Great Britain is estimated to be 41.6
37 kt/a: municipal effluent is the largest fraction with 60.7% of the P contribution, while the
38 agricultural and industrial contributions are 28.3% and 4.6% respectively (and others 6.4%)
39 (White and Hammond, 2002). The total phosphorus (TP) concentration in typical municipal
40 wastewater depends on the local water consumption and it ranges from 4-25 mg/l (Henze et al.
41 2008). The principal sources of P in municipal wastewater in the UK are black water (66%)
42 and grey water (34%) (White & Hammond 2002).

43 Since domestic wastewater is a main source of P, the EU (EU Parliament Regulation 2004) and
44 countries such as USA, Canada or Japan, have focused their efforts during the last decades on
45 reducing the P content in detergents (European Commission 2012). In 2010, the Detergents

46 Regulations in the UK (UK Parliament 2010) banned the commercialization of domestic
47 laundry detergent that contained more than 0.4% of inorganic phosphates (Richards et al.
48 2015). Hence, to complement the measures to control P at source, many governments are
49 setting strict pollutant discharge limits in their environmental policies. The European Waste
50 Water Directive (European Commission 1991) sets discharge limits concentrations in
51 wastewater effluents to sensitive areas at 1-2 mg/l for TP (depending on the population).
52 However, in order to meet the standards of the receiving waters, required by the Water
53 Framework Directive (European Commission 2000) it is expected that discharge P limits will
54 have to be further reduced and in some cases it may be as low as 0.1 mg/l (Parliamentary Office
55 of Science and Technology 2014).

56 Because of the need for efficient treatment, new technologies have been developed to enhance
57 P removal from sewage but with the increased effectiveness their cost has risen. Thus, to meet
58 these legal requirements, the wastewater industry faces the problem of providing efficient but
59 low cost, low energy and low carbon wastewater treatments. Land treatment - defined by Crites
60 et al., (2000, p. 7) as the “controlled application of water onto the land surface to achieve a
61 specified level of treatment through natural, physical, chemical, and biological processes
62 within the plant-soil-water matrix”- can help to overcome these challenges, however such
63 systems have a finite capacity for P removal because of the limited adsorption capacity of the
64 soil.

65 The aim of this paper is to critically review the existing knowledge and tools available for
66 making reliable predictions about how long a Land Treatment System (LTS) can effectively
67 perform as a tertiary treatment for wastewater without compromising the quality of the nearby
68 environment and to identify the current knowledge gaps in long-term P removal behaviour of
69 these systems. In order to analyse the previous studies about long term performance of LTS,
70 the state-of-the-art is examined using the following approach: description of LTS and problems

71 associated with P forms in this type of natural wastewater treatment; analysis of current
72 knowledge regarding P removal and longevity in laboratory-scale and full-scale systems; and
73 finally, evaluation of the gaps for further research needs.

74 **2. LAND TREATMENT SYSTEMS**

75 Since humans established permanently in communities, LTS have been used as a way to
76 manage wastewater (Inc. Metcalf & Eddy et al. 2003). Historical reports illustrate the use of
77 LTS in early Greek and Chinese civilizations as an irrigation and sanitation method
78 (Tzanakakis et al. 2007), but it was not until the second half of the 19th century when “sewage
79 farming” (a historical term used for LTS) was used to protect public health after the cholera
80 epidemics in England. This expansion drove the development of the basic principles of
81 planning, operation and management of the systems. By that time, the first LTS appeared in
82 the USA, France and Germany contributing to the development of the technology. However,
83 their use declined as a result of the development of more intensive treatments to cope with
84 population growth and lack of land availability (Jewell & Seabrook 1979). In the USA, the
85 Clean Water Act (The 92nd United States Congress 1972) renewed interest in land treatments
86 when planners realized that these systems were able to meet new discharge requirements of the
87 National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System. Recently, interest in these systems has been
88 renewed due to the possibilities that they offer as on-site treatments for remote areas and small
89 communities, overcoming the high energy cost of conventional systems. In addition, they have
90 been used as a tertiary treatment for polishing effluent from Wastewater Treatment Plants
91 (WWTP), in some cases utilising the supply of nutrient-rich water for biomass production for
92 economic benefit (Paranychianakis et al. 2006; Nissim et al. 2015).

93 During the period 1920-1970, LTS were used as a tertiary treatment in the UK to provide
94 confidence with respect to meeting the so-called Royal Commission 20:30 biological oxygen

95 demand: suspended solids discharge consent standard which was widely applied at British
96 wastewater treatment works (Gray 1989). Many of these LTS were subsequently inherited by
97 the regional water authorities following the Water Act (1973) and remain today. Sweaney
98 (2011) gathered data in relation to organic matter, suspended solids and ammonia removal from
99 20 LTS used for tertiary treatment by UK water companies and found that the systems did not
100 have any formal design and used different applications rates and sizes (probably due to the lack
101 of official guidance), this made it difficult to draw conclusions about any performance trend.
102 The study however did not show results for P (Sweaney, 2011).

103 Compared to mechanical or chemical wastewater treatments, LTS are cheaper to operate and
104 maintain, whilst also being less energy demanding (Sapkota et al. 2014; Tzanakakis et al.
105 2007). Their main constraint is that they require larger amounts of land than conventional
106 centralised wastewater treatments, so they have largely been used in rural areas, for single
107 household or small-scale applications, where land availability is not a problem. They have been
108 successfully implemented for small communities (< 10 000 p.e.) in Scandinavia, the UK,
109 Australia and USA.

110 Depending on the loading rate and flow path, LTS can be classified, into: slow rate (SR),
111 overland flow (OF) and rapid infiltration (RI) systems (Smith 2006). Each achieves different
112 performance outcomes and can/not be implemented, depending on the site characteristics and
113 the desired level of treatment (Table1). In LTS, the main treatment mechanisms are: chemical
114 retention and transformation, mechanical retention and biological transformation. While
115 mechanical retention (e.g. grass filters strips) and biological transformation can treat pollutants
116 such as solids, organic matter (OM), nitrogen and pathogenic microorganisms; adsorption and
117 precipitation are the main processes responsible for P removal in soils (Vohla et al. 2011).
118 These mechanisms differ from soil to soil and depend significantly on soil surface chemistry
119 and pH.

120 Each type of soil is characterized by a P fixation capacity and is dependent on the number of
121 reactive sites that can react with the phosphate. It depends on the amount and type of clay
122 present, the soil pH and the OM content. When all the P-fixation sites are filled, the maximum
123 phosphorus-fixing capacity of the soil is reached, thus the soil is supersaturated with P (Brady
124 & Weil 2008). Consequently, P removal in LTS is a finite process (Drizo et al. 2002). In these
125 situations the required level of P removal is not achieved and excess P can be released to the
126 environment either in leachate or runoff as dissolved P.

127 Although longevity of the LTS is one of the key parameters to achieve cost-effective
128 treatments, little research has been carried out regarding effects of long term wastewater
129 application in LTS and the longevity of the system in terms of P removal (Hu et al., 2006).
130 Three key questions regarding long-term P removal in LTS remain (Hu et al. 2005; Hu et al.
131 2006; Robertson 2012; Weiss et al. 2008; Moura et al. 2011; Eweborn et al. 2012; Eweborn et
132 al. 2014): i) is the required knowledge available about how long one of these systems can
133 immobilize P?, ii) what are the mechanisms involved and what is their relative importance?
134 and iii) what should be the approach to estimate of the P removal capacity by LTS in the long
135 term?

136 **3. PHOSPHORUS REMOVAL PROCESSES IN LAND TREATMENT SYSTEMS**

137 The main removal phosphorus mechanisms in natural treatments are vegetation uptake,
138 microbial processes, precipitation and adsorption (Reddy et al. 1999). In overland flow systems
139 vegetation uptake removal pathway can be significant (~20-30%) if vegetation is harvested
140 regularly (Crites et al. 2006). Precipitation is the process in which phosphates can be removed
141 from the soil solution when it reacts with Fe, Al, Mn (acidic soils) or Ca (basic soils) to form
142 phosphate minerals. This process is considered to be irreversible but depends on pH, redox
143 conditions and the concentration of the mineral ions in solutions required to precipitate

144 (McCray et al. 2009). Adsorption is the process of fixation (chemisorption) of PO_4 ions to soil
145 particles. P interacts with soil particles in its exchangeable orthophosphate form, the pH drives
146 the availability of each orthophosphoric form in the soil solution H_3PO_4 , $\text{H}_2\text{PO}_4^{-1}$, HPO_4^{-2} and
147 PO_4^{-3} , at soil pH, PO_4^{-3} has the strongest binding capacity (MacBride 1994). Positive charged
148 soils with Fe, Al, Ca content attract phosphate (PO_4) anions but they can also be adsorbed to
149 the soil surface through non-electrostatic forces (Evangelou 1998). Adsorption is fast process
150 but desorption is usually slower. It is driven by an equilibrium constant and if the concentration
151 of PO_4 ions rise in the soil solution, the ion will adsorb to soil charged surfaces to restore the
152 equilibrium. Adsorption is limited by the number of available sorption sites (McCray et al.
153 2009)

154 Despite the numerous studies and significant knowledge regarding all these processes, it is
155 complicated to predict P removal performance in LTS as different environments (soil pH, soil
156 type, temperature, etc.) will promote different processes that operate at different rates (McCray
157 et al. 2009). Current understanding of soil P availability to plants gives us a conceptual model
158 to help us to understand P dynamics in LTS. Syers, Johnston & Curtin, (2008) proposed that
159 phosphorus in soil can be considered to be in one of four different pools on the basis of its
160 availability to the plant: immediately available P in soil solution, readily available P that is
161 adsorbed weakly at the soil surface, more strongly bound P that is less available, and finally
162 very strongly bound P that is either of very low availability or inaccessible. High concentrations
163 of P in soil solution due to wastewater irrigation (~ 10 mg P/l) will encourage an initial rapid
164 phase of P sorption on high-affinity sites on the soil surface (Paranychianakis et al. 2006). The
165 positive charges associated with soils with a high anion exchange capacity allow rapid, readily-
166 reversible and non-specific electrostatic adsorption of anions such as phosphate. These sorption
167 processes are pH dependent and are likely to be associated with the surfaces of Fe and Al
168 minerals in strongly acid to neutral systems and on Ca minerals in neutral to alkaline systems

169 (Lindsay 1980). A slower phase of P removal is attributed to phosphorus diffusion in poorly
170 accessible sites and/or to chemical precipitation which apportions P to the strongly-bound pool
171 (Paranychianakis et al. 2006; Syers et al. 2008). Inorganic P compounds in soils are commonly
172 associated with iron, aluminium, and calcium. These compounds have a high degree of
173 variability in their solubility and stability which are influenced by pH. Those compounds with
174 very low solubility, such as apatite ($\text{Ca}_{10}(\text{PO}_4)_6(\text{OH},\text{F},\text{Cl})_2$), would be associated with the very
175 low availability pool.

176 One of the key issues related to the study of lifespan of LTS is the time dependency component
177 in the P immobilization reaction (Paranychianakis et al. 2006; Cucarella & Renman 2009). It
178 consists of a two-step reaction: an initial and fast sorption phase and a slower phase related to
179 P diffusion or/and chemical precipitation. However, the secondary slow or irreversible sorption
180 that has been widely documented in these laboratory studies was not evident in long term P
181 monitoring in septic tanks plumes in Canada by Robertson (2008). Consequently, Robertson
182 concluded that, secondary P attenuation processes, such as P diffusion into soil particle
183 microsites, slow recrystallization of sorbed P to insoluble metal phosphate minerals, or slow
184 direct precipitation could be inactive in ground water zones or too slow to be observed in the
185 16-year period of the study, suggesting that P can be remain mobile for decades with the
186 consequent risk of impact to nearby rivers and lakes.

187 If soil characteristics change over time, P sorption capacity (PSC) may not remain constant,
188 which has implications for LTS lifetime estimations. Changes in physical and chemical soil
189 properties due to continuous application of wastewater have been characterized from previous
190 studies. These changes may also affect the P sorption capacity of the soil which is often
191 assumed to remain constant for a certain site during the lifespan of the LTS (Hu et al. 2005).
192 Hu et al. (2006) described an increase in pH from 5.6 to 7.0 in the top 15 cm layer of the soil
193 after more than 30 years of high pH (~8.5) wastewater application coming from a paper mill

194 (25%), other industries (~25%) and (~25%) from domestic wastewater in the Muskegon
195 Wastewater Treatment facility (USA) with major soil types categorized as sands. These results
196 are consistent with those of Richardson et al. (1988) who reported statistically significant
197 increases ($P>0.95$) in North Carolina in three acidic mineral soils at a coastal plain swamp after
198 municipal wastewater additions for 30 years. On the contrary, Eveborn et al. (2014) in their
199 study of P accumulation and mobility in soil treatment systems after 8 to 11 years of domestic
200 wastewater application in sand filter beds, revealed that the pH of the top layer was between 1-
201 2 units lower than in reference samples. Their interpretation in this case was that the pH change
202 was due to the chemical dissolution and consumption of reactive calcium oxide and other
203 alkaline minerals or acidifying organic degradation processes. However, the study points out
204 that the results in the surface layer might be also have been affected by surface regeneration
205 works carried out during the study. Moreover, due to long-term high salt content effluent
206 application in the Muskegon studies, exchangeable Ca concentrations increased ten fold
207 (Zhang et al. 2007; Hu et al. 2005; Hu et al. 2006). Hu et al. (2006) suggests that the increase
208 in the pH might have as a consequence the increase in the exchangeable Ca in the topsoil and
209 links this with the possibility of an extension of the lifespan of the LTS. The experiments of
210 Eveborn et al. (2014) also suggest that the increase in oxalate extractable Al and Fe could be
211 due to weathering mechanisms provoked by acidification of the soil after the wastewater
212 additions, which will also affect the sorption capacity of the soil.

213 It is clear that efficiency of P removal declines with time, with slower sorption processes
214 approaching the equilibrium, and that a number of factors affect it (soil mineral type, amount
215 of clay, pH, OM, anion presence or temperature). However, Drizo et al. 2002 and Hu et al.
216 2005 pointed out the possibility of long-term P accumulation and removal capacity
217 regeneration. The proposed mechanism depends upon the formation of new P-retentive surface
218 clusters through phosphate compound adsorption that act as new reactive sites for adsorption

219 and precipitation. Ekeborn et al. 2014 also suggests that P bound to the surface in stable pools
220 may in the long term increase the P sorption capacity of soils due to changes in pH and in
221 oxalate-extractable metals during the wastewater application. Furthermore, Drizo et al. 2002
222 demonstrated that a wetland constructed using electric arc furnace slag as a filter medium got
223 back 74% of its P retention capacity after four weeks rest and claim that other studies observed
224 that soils had restored their P adsorption capacity after repeated wetting and drying cycles. The
225 mechanisms involved are not well understood, but it is suggested that it is related with elevated
226 pH after draining the material that will bring Ca, Fe and other mineral ions in supersaturation
227 with the solution to create new sites for P adsorption/precipitation in the filter pores Bisone et
228 al. (2016) studied behaviour of a clay soil with wastewater additions and the influence of
229 hydraulic loading. The study focused on the evaluation of wetting and drying cycles in clay
230 soil used for wastewater treatment and results indicated the potential to adsorb P and that
231 saturation and desaturation cycles did not influence phosphate retention but enhanced
232 nitrification. However, the soil saturation can lead into P desorption caused by Fe reduction
233 and therefore intermittent loading can favour infiltration and help to avoid desorption
234 Therefore, LTS design and management approaches which permit resting periods could allow
235 the use of clay soils as a longer term polishing treatment for P removal.

236 **4. METHODS TO ASSESS PHOSPHORUS REMOVAL CAPACITY IN SOILS**

237 The standard tests to assess P transport in soils (such as water extractable phosphate,
238 exchangeable phosphate, sorption and desorption isotherms) are usually based on agronomic
239 aspects of P availability for the plant and not to determine environmental risk of P loss in soils
240 (Moura et al. 2011). Although they can be used to quantify the nature and quantity of P
241 concentrations in the soil, a better understanding is needed to determine which of those indices
242 are more suitable to better assess long-term P fate in LTS.

243 Hooda et al. (2000) studied the potential of different soil tests to predict P release to water of
244 different soils in the UK that had received long-term fertilization or sewage sludge: Soil Test
245 P (STP), sorption–desorption indices, the degree of saturation of P (DPS) and the amount of
246 water dissolvable-P. The study discussed that the DSP of the soils is more important than other
247 indices because soil extractable-P does not integrate the P soil characteristics, but the DSP
248 index associates P management and soil type factors helping to identify soils that are likely to
249 become diffuse sources. Moura et al. (2011) studied the effects of long-term reclaimed water
250 application on P leaching potential in rapid infiltration basins, the study concluded that
251 extractable P and P-saturation ratio are good indicators of soluble concentrations in the
252 leachates. Furthermore, Hu et al. (2005) reported that labile P distribution is not a good
253 indicator of P leaching in soil wastewater treatments since it is not correlated with TP, Fe-
254 bound P, or Ca/Mg-bound P, but, identified the need for a new index that integrates DSP and
255 Ca adsorption.

256 Traditionally, the P removal capacity of the soils has been related to the absorption-adsorption
257 P capacity. This can be determined by batch-scale experiments where the soil interacts with
258 solutions at different P concentrations until the equilibrium is reached, and translated to
259 Langmuir or Freundlich equations to represent their kinetic relationship (Kovar & Pierzynski
260 2009). However, many researchers agree that there is a lack of studies advising how to interpret
261 and use such batch experimental results to assess long term effects and life expectancy of soil
262 infiltration systems (Zhang et al. 2007; Cucarella & Renman 2009; Hu et al. 2006; Eveborn et
263 al. 2012; Drizo et al. 2002).

264 Nair et al. (1984) identified a wide range of methodologies that had been used to determine P
265 adsorption. Although diverse methodologies made the comparison among studies difficult,
266 they proposed a standard method to predict the partitioning of the dissolved inorganic P. In
267 addition, Graetz & Nair (2000) pointed out that the laboratory procedures to determine the P

268 adsorption had advantages; such as the possibility to separate the soil and solution or the
269 possibility to obtain the necessary volume sample for carrying out the tests. However, they also
270 described experimental disadvantages such as particle breakdown while shaking. The study of
271 Hooda et al. (2000) asserts that phosphorus adsorption-desorption isotherms are useful to
272 compare soil characteristics but their empirical nature make them unsuitable to explain
273 mechanisms of sorption-desorption of P in soils as they do not reflect field conditions like
274 runoff or rainfall.

275 The Onsite Wastewater Treatment Systems Manual from the Office of Research and
276 Development of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (2002) states that the estimation
277 of soil capacity removal can be based on sorption isotherms but it totally underestimates the
278 capacity of P removal since they do not reflect the slow reactions that take place (the standard
279 procedure extraction time is 24h) and declare that studies revealed that, in the long term, the
280 capacity could be extended from standard isotherms predictions by 1.5-3 times. Similarly, Hu
281 et al. (2006) evaluated the effects of long-term wastewater application on sorption capacity of
282 the soil by comparing the 1-day maximum sorption capacity (P_{max}) before and after long-term
283 wastewater application. The study revealed that the 1-day P_{max} increased by ~3 times since the
284 start of wastewater application indicating that it is possible for the soil to continuously adsorb
285 P and therefore, difficult to get a reliable estimate of P_{max} . *Ádám et al. (2005)* attempted to
286 estimate the long-term P sorption capacity of filter materials. The study criticizes the use of 24-
287 h sorption batch tests claiming that results differ from full-scale systems. To get more reliable
288 long-term P sorption estimations they proposed a long-term experiment of a full scale
289 horizontal constructed wetland (CW) and also concluded that batch experiments are not
290 appropriate to measure sorption capacity materials because the experimental parameters (e.g.
291 soil solution P concentration and water:soil ratio) are usually higher than in full-scale systems.
292 However with full-scale constructed wetlands the extrapolation of the results are more difficult

293 because of the complexity of the systems due to biofilm developments or the presence of plants
294 that can enhance the P removal but can also generate cracks or pores in the material leading to
295 preferential flow (Ádám & Krogstad 2006).

296 Cucarella and Renman (2009) exhaustively and critically reviewed batch experiments used to
297 estimate the PSC of filter materials used in on-site wastewater treatments. The study confirmed
298 the findings of Nair et al. (1984) by certifying that different studies are not comparable because
299 they are arbitrarily run under different experimental conditions and with different experimental
300 parameters such as, solution-ratio during shaking, P concentrations of the soil water, contact
301 time, agitation characteristics and temperature. As those parameters have the potential to
302 significantly influence P processes they should be properly established in the experimental set
303 up to reduce their influence in the PSC determination. Additionally, experiments should, as
304 much as possible, represent real field conditions. Drizo et al. (2002) recommended to couple
305 batch experiments with long-term column experiments for P removal efficiency studies in order
306 to integrate the effect of soil chemical and hydrological properties.

307 Column experiments are frequently used to determine hydrological properties, evaluate
308 transport models and monitor fate and mobility of pollutants in soil (Lewis & Sjöstrom 2010).
309 However, Zhang et al. (2007) criticised previous column tests used to predict the fate of P in
310 slow rate wastewater treatment soils. The tests used high hydraulic loading rates (up to 250
311 times those typically used slow rate systems) and were fed continuously, which does not
312 correspond with typical LTS management parameters and, according to Hu et al. (2006), these
313 column tests were not run for long enough to allow slow P precipitation. Evehorn et al. (2014)
314 set up experimental columns to study the P removal and leaching potential of soil materials
315 using deionized water. Results indicated that P removal in unsaturated soil depends on P
316 loading, and that wash-out processes can take place in these systems, for example, during rain
317 events and that dissolution of aluminium phosphates and the shift in ionic strength could be a

318 possible P release mechanism. Drizo et al. (2002) aimed to determine the long-term P saturation
319 of filter materials through column experiments. The study revealed the advantages of P
320 saturation obtained from column experiments compared to batch experiments, for example
321 particles do not breakdown as a result of the shaking and the saturation is progressive. The
322 study finally recommended P feeding concentration in column tests between 40-400 mg/l to
323 reach the saturation point of filter materials in a practical timescale and experiments lasting 3-
324 5 months to allow time for slower P retention processes to occur.

325 Direct mass balance calculations ($P_{\text{accumulated}} = P_{\text{inlet}} - P_{\text{outlet}}$) of long-term performance systems
326 have also been used to assess the P removal capacity of soils although few attempts of
327 evaluating the P removal performance of full-scale long-term sewage effluent irrigated soils
328 have been reported. Kardos & Hook (1976) quantified the P added, removed by crops or
329 leached over 10 years of irrigation with treated municipal wastewater. They concluded that
330 soluble P concentrations at 120 cm depth in a clay loam soil remained close to 0.05 mg/l and,
331 <2% of the P added was leached in 10 years without vegetation removal. The same experience
332 in sandy loam reported 3% leaching. Hu et al. (2006) performed a 27 years mass balance of the
333 Muskegon wastewater treatment plant (USA), reporting 99% retention of the P applied.
334 Eveborn et al. (2012) studied the performance of four Swedish uncovered soil treatment
335 community-scale systems aged from 14 to 22 years old. Using a mass balance approach, the
336 treatments presented much poorer P removal (8-16%) than previous soil treatment reports.
337 Robertson (2012) quantified the P retained in a lakeshore non-calcareous sand filter with water
338 table fluctuations, and compared it with the estimated lifetime after 20 years of operation.
339 Contrary to Eveborn's findings, the results showed that the filter bed had retained almost all of
340 the P loaded with the wastewater over the two decades of operation. More recently, Dzakpasu
341 et al. (2015) studied the long-term capacity and efficiency of a soil substrate full-scale
342 integrated constructed wetland in Ireland, by studying the wastewater inflow, outflow and

343 storage of P in plants and sediments. Results revealed a 91% a total P removal, where 58% of
344 P storage is accounted for P removal in the soil. One of the largest experiences with soil
345 infiltration systems is situated in Bardu (Norway), where municipal wastewater from 5000
346 inhabitants has been pumped into glaciofluvial sand and gravel deposit infiltration basins at a
347 mean temperature of +0.7°C. After 25 years of operation the treatment performance was 99%
348 P removal and still it was estimated to last 12 years more (Jenssen et al. 2014). Reddy et al.
349 (1999) identified the main difficulties when trying to assess P retention in wetlands as: failure
350 to identify and measure inputs and outputs of P and water, use of only one form of P,
351 comparison of synchronous flows and grabbing samples from strong variable flow or
352 concentration. Therefore, the few attempts at quantifying the P removal efficiency of long-term
353 full-scale experiences in natural treatments have been reported, mainly in grasslands and
354 temperate climates, with variable results. The results comparison among studies indicates high
355 removal variability probably due to differences in soil chemical properties, age of the system
356 or sampling and calculation methodologies.

357 **5. TOWARDS ESTIMATES OF LONGEVITY**

358 There is not a clear definition regarding life expectancy or longevity of LTS (Yu 2012). In fact,
359 there is a common misunderstanding between exhaustion of P, retention capacity of the
360 material and longevity of the system. From the point of view of on-site treatments, longevity
361 must be interpreted as the time when the system reaches the effluent P discharge limit (Heistad
362 et al., 2006), which differs among countries and legislations in terms of both concentration and
363 exceedance statistics. A number of studies have calculated longevity from a simple approach,
364 the P_{\max} sorption capacity of the soil (g of P/kg), the volume of land being used for treatment
365 (m^3), P content of applied wastewater (g of P/PE) and the discharge rate (g P/day) (Table 2).
366 However, the limitations discussed in previous sections highlighted how experimental

367 conditions in P_{\max} assessment can contribute to errors in such a lifetime forecast. Cucarella &
368 Renman (2009), Vohla et al. (2011) and Chang et al. (2014) noted these limitations and
369 suggested that life expectancy calculations could not be entirely addressed through filter
370 materials characteristics and that, to forecast precisely the lifespan of the system, other factors
371 (including hydrological conditions, temperature and microbiological transformations) must be
372 taken into consideration.

373 Simulation models can help to better understand the importance of bio-physico-chemical and
374 hydraulic processes relevant to pollutant removal, while helping to further understand how
375 design parameters affect the performance of the system and predict longevity and exhaustion
376 of the material (Beach & McCray 2003). Recently, researchers have gone beyond the black-
377 box, empirical models, to develop mechanistic models that consider the hydrodynamic and
378 biodegradation process in natural treatments (García et al. 2010). They cover a wide range of
379 biokinetic, process-dedicated, and design support models (Meyer et al. 2015). Process
380 dedicated models represent degradation and transfer of compounds; hence they can help with
381 understanding the fate of P and removal in LTS. These models describe P transport and sorption
382 by soil or filter materials under different hydrological conditions and some of them predict
383 breakthrough curves (Langergraber & Šimůnek 2012; Claveau-Mallet et al. 2014; Sinclair,
384 Jamieson, Gordon, et al. 2014; Sinclair, Jamieson, Madani, et al. 2014; Liolios et al. 2015).

385 Intensive research has been produced since the late-1970's to develop models able to simulate
386 the interaction in between the soil matrix, the water transport and P. The main aims of these
387 models was to evaluate non-point source pollution of subsurface waters by agricultural P
388 (Vadas et al. 2013). Many of these models have been updated through time and continuously
389 developed. Different models have been used to accomplish the aims depending on spatial scale
390 and resolution (watershed, field-scale), time scale (long-term, short-term), and the
391 hydrological system (saturated flow, variable saturated flow, horizontal flow and, vertical

392 flow). These models can be divided into ones that use a water balance model and the ones that
393 use numerical solution of the Richard's equation. The models based on Richard's equation are
394 more input intensive and computationally demanding than the water balance models but they
395 provide more accurate solutions for field scale modelling. Regarding the overview of soil
396 phosphorus dynamics of those models. McGechan & Lewis (2002b) provided an exhaustive
397 review of a number of field scale P dynamics models and the equations used (e.g. ANIMO
398 (Groenendijk & Kroes 1999), GLEAMS (Leonard et al. 1986), MACRO (Jarvis & Larsbo
399 2012) and DAYCENT (Parton et al. 1998)), pointing out MACRO as the most complete model
400 for soil transport processes but with more simple representations of P transformation.

401 Some of the most recent experiences of numerical modelling of on-site wastewater treatments
402 and phosphorus fate predictions are related with the use of HYDRUS (J. Šimůnek, M. Šejna,
403 H. Saito, M. Sakai 2013). HYDRUS-1D and 2D are able to simulate one and two-dimensional
404 movement of water, heat and multiple solutes in variably-saturated media and can be coupled
405 with different specific modules like wetland module (CW2D) to be able to run P degradation
406 along with other processes (Langergraber & Šimůnek 2012). Recently, Langergraber (2016)
407 reviewed process-based models applicable to subsurface flow wetlands treatment, and
408 identified the HYDRUS Wetland Module as one of the most advanced ones because of its
409 multi-component biokinetics-models and stated that it is powerful tool for understanding
410 wetland processes. PHREEQC (Parkhurst & Appelo 1999) can also be coupled with HYDRUS
411 and be used to solve complex geochemical calculations (Claveau-Mallet et al. 2014). In
412 addition, MODFLOW (Twarakavi et al. 2008) is a 3D finite-difference groundwater model that
413 can be also coupled and adapted with HYDRUS.

414 The HYDRUS-1D and 2D numerical code since version 4.0, released in 2007, is capable of
415 simulating a large quantity of non-equilibrium flow and transport processes. They can be
416 divided in physical non-equilibrium and chemical non equilibrium processes. The study by

417 Šimůnek & van Genuchten (2008) gave an overview of the conceptual models, and the
418 specifications of each model with the water flow equations, the solute transport equations and
419 the number of parameters needed in each. This new feature provides a wide range of
420 possibilities to simulate phosphorus transport in soils, such as dual permeability models to
421 simulate water flow in two different domains, with different flow velocities and non-
422 equilibrium chemical models. These models range from the simple one kinetic site model
423 described as a first-order rate equation to two sites models with different sorption kinetics for
424 different fractions, where one fraction is assumed to be instantaneous and the other one is
425 kinetic. Vogel et al. (2015) successfully simulated flow and transport in a two-dimensional
426 dual-permeability system with spatially variable hydraulic properties permitting to compare
427 different spatial distributions of hydraulic properties with model responses comparison.

428 Regarding P studies with HYDRUS Naseri et al (2011) compared physical modelling of silty
429 clay-loam texture columns against the numerical modelling of HYDRUS-3D, the results
430 concluded that it simulated the water flow in the columns successfully, but overestimated the
431 final sorbed PO_4 concentrations in the soil. Elmi et al. (2012) found similar over-estimation
432 results when using HYDRUS-1D to study the vertical distribution and transport processes of
433 PO_4 in soil columns. The simulation indicated that 98% of the P applied was accumulated in
434 the first 0.2 m of the column and decreased with depth. Sinclair et al. (2014a) also used
435 HYDRUS-2D to simulate different lateral flow sand filters in on-site wastewater treatments
436 after septic tanks showing poor removal rates and effluent exceeding 1 mg P/l concentration at
437 the end of the study. Morrissey et al. (2015) studied with HYDRUS-2D the impact of
438 unsewered cluster housing simulating the attenuation of contaminants through the unsaturated
439 zone revealing limited impact to groundwater quality, and used the calibrated model to simulate
440 the impact of increasing the house density with new developments. All those studies were

441 focused on studying transport and contamination effects but none of them introduced the time
442 variable in the study in order to predict remaining lifetime.

443 Although a number of studies point out the potential for exhaustion of the P sorption capacity
444 in treatment systems, there have only been a few attempts to forecast P longevity in soil
445 infiltration systems. The first one is related with the Muskegon (USA) (Zhang & Dahab 2006)
446 wastewater treatment plant which was part of the large-scale demonstration project for nutrient
447 removal. The project aimed to evaluate long-term P performance, as it is known to be one of
448 the most important lifespan limiting factors. The first phase of the study calculated new 1-day
449 P_{max} after 30 years of operation and the new remaining life expectancy (RLE). The new
450 estimations had an extension in the RLE because of the changes in soil properties after long-
451 term wastewater application in the soil (Hu et al. 2006). The second phase of the same study
452 consisted of column breakthrough modelling, where they re-calculated the RLE (Zhang et al.
453 2007). As a result, the study proposed a remaining life expectancy prediction formula:

$$454 \qquad \qquad \qquad RLE = t_b * F / 180 \qquad \qquad \qquad (1)$$

455 where

456 t_b = the breakthrough day

457 180=the irrigation days per year at the Muskegon plant

458 F= the correction factor for the inlet P concentration and the concentration used in the
459 study.

460 The same project proposed a model based on the mass balance principle. The empirical model
461 is able to predict the life expectancy on a yearly basis through the effects of the main
462 operational parameters of the system (rotating crop type, hydraulic loading rate, annual
463 precipitation, soil type, etc.). However, the interaction between the soil and the hydraulic
464 systems are not reflected upon. Parkhurst et al. (2003) described a reactive-transport model

465 developed to simulate P in the sewage plume from treated sewage effluent to ground-
466 infiltration disposal beds at the Massachusetts Military Reservation on western Cape Cod
467 (USA). The simulations covered the discharged period (1936-1995) and the 60 following years
468 after cessation of disposal. The three-dimensional reactive-transport model used to develop the
469 base-case was PHAST (Parkhurst & Kipp 2002), model limitations were associated with
470 loading, flow systems and sorption characteristics of the aquifer uncertainties. Regardless that
471 the aim was not to study the longevity of the system because the activity of the filter beds had
472 stopped, it is a useful exercise of long-term plume migration modeling. Yu (2012) attempted a
473 one-dimensional model that aimed to provide the longevity of any point of the infiltration
474 system considering a homogeneous and isotropic soil, and constant and unsaturated flow. It
475 was aimed to estimate the longevity, the exhaustion time and sorbed P. The model proposed
476 was a contaminant solute transport model where advection, diffusion, dispersion and sorption
477 reactions were represented. The simulation indicated that the most sensitive factors for P
478 concentration in a soil column to reach critical concentration were the average pore flow
479 velocity and the P sorption capacity of the soil. The longevity estimations from the model
480 compared to the service time of the infiltration study sites were shorter Herrmann et al. (2013)
481 modelled the transport and removal of PO_4 in a reactive filter using the hydro-geochemical
482 transport code PHREEQC (Parkhurst & Appelo 2011), the study claims that in order to be used
483 to forecast performance and longevity it needs to be further tested and develop due to that it
484 does not take into consideration adsorption processes or the effect of biofilms growth in the
485 filter material. Claveau-Mallet et al. (2014) proposed a prediction tool for slag filter longevity
486 based on dissolution and precipitation kinetics. The proposed methodology was based on three
487 steps: (1) experimental batch tests methodology, (2) numerical calibration of the batch test (3)
488 numerical simulations of the filter. However the study assumed several limitations and
489 highlighting the principal one as being the assumption that the contact between the water and

490 the filter particles is limited, and not being affected by clogging from precipitates or particulate
491 OM. The model needs to be calibrated before being used as a design tool and proposes to couple
492 a hydrodynamic and geochemical code such as HYDRUS-PHREEQC to overcome those
493 drawbacks.

494 **6. SYNTHESIS AND CONCLUSIONS**

495 LTS have been in use since wastewater treatments were applied to protect public health and
496 still they have a role to play at the current wastewater industry as a low energy and low
497 maintenance polishing step for small wastewater treatments. They are normally used before the
498 wastewater treatment plant effluent is released to the environment to avoid environmental
499 problems, mainly eutrophication related with excessive P concentrations.

500 P removal mechanisms in LTS are physical retention, sorption processes and microbial and
501 plant uptake. Sorption is a finite process and depends on the interaction with the environment
502 and the chemical properties of the soil (ion presence, pH, OM, clay content, etc). Thus, if this
503 conditions change over time, mainly due to long-term wastewater irrigation, the P removal
504 potential will also change.

505 It is well accepted that estimation of the P sorption capacity of soils by batch experiments has
506 several limitations when it is used to calculate the P_{\max} in the long term or when used to forecast
507 the longevity of the system. The standard methodology is a short-term sorption analysis (24h)
508 that underestimates the long-term removal capacity because it does not take into account the
509 slow precipitation processes and because the experimental set up does not represent the real
510 systems and interactions with the ecosystem. Thus, studies advise that these methods are not
511 used for lifespan prediction but to compare materials and soils characteristics. Column
512 experiments should be also correctly design when addressing long-term P removal

513 characterization and filter material saturation, mainly regarding length of the experiment and
514 hydraulic loading in order to correctly translate results to full-scale experiences.

515 Regarding lifetime predictions in LTS, usually, direct mass balance approach using the P_{\max}
516 has been used, however the drawbacks previously pointed out also affect this methodology.
517 Using modelling tools to assess the water flow, contaminant transformation and contaminant-
518 transport processes can help to assist in the integration of all the parameters that affect the
519 functioning of the system. However, few attempts to estimate the P longevity of LTS through
520 models have been found and none of them has been completed and published due to several
521 limitations and further development and research needed (uncertainties in data acquisition,
522 empirical models, models not validated or neglecting important variables of the removal
523 processes).

524 LTS's modelling challenge lies in getting useful results from batch and column experiment
525 regarding soil P adsorption behaviour in the long term, and how to transfer those experimental
526 results into the solute transport equation. The longevity of the LTS is one of the key parameters
527 to achieve cost-effective treatments and if new studies are able to successfully model treatment
528 scenarios then we will become a useful LTS management tool and provide greater confidence
529 in the sustainable operation of these systems required by both operators and regulators.

530 FUNDING

531 This work was supported by Albion Water Ltd. and Cranfield University.

532

533

534

- 536 Ádám, K. et al., 2005. Phosphorous sorption by Filtralite P—Small scale box experiment.
537 *Journal of Environmental Science and Health, Part A*, 40(6–7), pp.1239–1250.
- 538 Ádám, K. & Krogstad, T., 2006. Sorption of phosphorous to Filtralite-P--the effect of different
539 scales. *Water Research*, 40(6), pp.1143–1154.
- 540 Beach, D.N.H. & McCray, J.E., 2003. Numerical modeling of unsaturated flow in wastewater
541 soil absorption systems. *Groundwater Monitoring & Remediation*, 23(2), pp.64–72.
- 542 Bisone, S. et al., 2016. Influence of loading rate and modes on infiltration of treated wastewater
543 in soil-based constructed wetland. *Environmental Technology*, 3330(June), pp.1–12.
- 544 Brady, N.C. & Weil, R.R., 2008. *The nature and properties of soils*. 14th ed., New Jersey:
545 Pearson Prentice Hall.
- 546 Carpenter, S.R. & Bennett, E.M., 2011. Reconsideration of the planetary boundary for
547 phosphorus. *Environ. Res. Lett*, 6, pp.14009–12.
- 548 Carpenter, S.R. & Caraco, N.F., 1998. Nonpoint pollution of surface waters with phosphorus
549 and nitrogen. *Ecological Applications*, 8(3), pp.559–568.
- 550 Chang, J. et al., 2014. Comparative evaluation of total phosphorus removal performances for
551 treatment of domestic and secondary wastewater using integrated vertical-flow
552 constructed wetlands: two years' experience. *Desalination and Water Treatment*, 56(5),
553 pp.1379–1388.
- 554 Claveau-Mallet, D., Courcelles, B. & Comeau, Y., 2014. Phosphorus removal by steel slag
555 filters: modeling dissolution and precipitation kinetics to predict longevity. *Environmental*
556 *Science & Technology*, 48(13), pp.7486–93.
- 557 Crites, R.W., Middlebrooks, J.E. & Sherwood, C.R., 2006. *Natural wastewater treatment*
558 *systems*, Boca Raton: CRC Press.
- 559 Crites, R.W., Reed, S.C. & Bastian, R.K., 2000. *Land treatment systems for municipal and*
560 *industrial wastes*, New York: McGraw-Hill.
- 561 Cucarella, V. & Renman, G., 2009. Phosphorus sorption capacity of filter materials used for
562 on-site wastewater treatment determined in batch experiments-a comparative study.
563 *Journal of Environmental Quality*, 38(2), pp.381–92.
- 564 Dong, C.S. et al., 2005. Phosphorus retention capacity of filter media for estimating the
565 longevity of constructed wetland. *Water Research*, 39(11), pp.2445–2457.
- 566 Drizo, A. et al., 2002. Phosphorus saturation potential: A parameter for estimating the longevity
567 of constructed wetland systems. *Environmental Science & Technology*, 36(21), pp.4642–
568 4648.
- 569 Dzakpasu, M. et al., 2015. Assessment of long-term phosphorus retention in an integrated
570 constructed wetland treating domestic wastewater. *Environmental Science and Pollution*
571 *Research*, 22(1), pp.305–313.
- 572 Elmi, A. et al., 2012. Estimating phosphorus leachability in reconstructed soil columns using
573 HYDRUS-1D model. *Environmental Earth Sciences*, 65(6), pp.1751–1758.
- 574 EU Parliament Regulation, 2004. *EU Parliament Regulation (EC). No 648/2004 on detergents.*,

- 575 Luxembourg.
- 576 European Commission, 1991. Council Directive 91/271/ECC of 21 May 1991 concerning
577 urban waste water treatment. [1991] *OJ L135/40*, pp.40–52. Available at: <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX:31991L0271> [Accessed August 18,
578 2015].
- 580 European Commission, 2000. Directive 2000/60/EC of the European Parliament. *Directive*
581 *2000/60/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 October 2000 establishing*
582 *a framework for Community action in the field of water policy*, L327(October 2000), pp.1–
583 82.
- 584 European Commission, 2012. Regulation (EU) 259/2012 of 14 March 2012 amending
585 Regulation (EC) No 648/2004 as regards the use of phosphates and other phosphorus
586 compounds in consumer laundry detergents and consumer automatic dishwasher
587 detergents. [2012] *OJ L94/17*. Available at: <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:L:2012:094:0016:0021:en:PDF>
588 [Accessed April 8, 2015].
- 590 Evangelou, V.P., 1998. *Environmental soil and water chemistry. Principles and applications.*,
591 New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- 592 Evehorn, D. et al., 2014. Phosphorus in soil treatment systems: accumulation and mobility.
593 *Water research*, 64, pp.42–52.
- 594 Evehorn, D., Kong, D. & Gustafsson, J.P., 2012. Wastewater treatment by soil infiltration:
595 Long-term phosphorus removal. *Journal of Contaminant Hydrology*, 140–141, pp.24–33.
- 596 García, J. et al., 2010. Contaminant removal processes in subsurface-flow constructed
597 wetlands: a review. *Critical Reviews in Environmental Science and Technology*, 40(7),
598 pp.561–661.
- 599 Graetz, D. & Nair, V.D., 2000. Phosphorus sorption isotherm determination. In G. M.
600 Pierzynski, ed. *Methods of Phosphorus Analysis for Soils, Sediments, Residuals and*
601 *Waters*. Manhattan: Southern Cooperative Series, p. 110.
- 602 Gray, N.F., 1989. *Biology of wastewater treatment*, New York: Oxford University Press.
- 603 Groenendijk, P. & Kroes, J.G., 1999. Modelling the nitrogen and phosphorus leaching to
604 groundwater and surface water; ANIMO 3.5. Report 144.
- 605 Heistad, A. et al., 2006. A high-performance compact filter system treating domestic
606 wastewater. *Ecological Engineering*, 28(4), pp.374–379.
- 607 Henze, M. et al., 2008. Wastewater characterization. In *Biological wastewater treatment:*
608 *principles, modelling and design*. London: IWA Publishing.
- 609 Herrmann, I. et al., 2013. Modeling phosphate transport and removal in a compact bed filled
610 with a mineral-based sorbent for domestic wastewater treatment. *Journal of Contaminant*
611 *Hydrology*, 154, pp.70–77.
- 612 HMSO, 1973. *Water Act, Chapter 37. London: HMSO, 120*,
- 613 Hooda, P.S. et al., 2000. Relating soil phosphorus indices to potential phosphorus release to
614 water. *Journal of Environmental Quality*, 29(4), pp.1116–1171.
- 615 Hu, C. et al., 2005. Effects of long-term wastewater application on chemical properties and
616 phosphorus adsorption capacity in soils of a wastewater land treatment system.

- 617 *Environmental Science & Technology*, 39(18), pp.7240–7245.
- 618 Hu, C. et al., 2006. Muskegon wastewater land treatment system: fate and transport of
619 phosphorus in soils and life expectancy of the system. *Engineering in Life Sciences*, 6(1),
620 pp.17–25.
- 621 Inc. Metcalf & Eddy et al., 2003. *Wastewater engineering. treatment and reuse*. 4th ed.,
622 Boston: McGraw-Hill.
- 623 J. Šimůnek, M. Šejna, H. Saito, M. Sakai, and M.T. van G., 2013. The HYDRUS-1D Software
624 Package for Simulating the One-Dimensional Movement of Water, Heat, and Multiple
625 Solutes in Variably-Saturated Media. Version 4.17. , (June).
- 626 Jarvis, N. & Larsbo, M., 2012. MACRO (v5.2) Model use, calibration, and validation.
627 *American Society of Agricultural and Biological Engineers*, 55(4), pp.1413–1423.
- 628 Jenssen, P.D., Krogstad, T. & Halvorsen, K., 2014. Community wastewater infiltration at 69 o
629 northern latitude – 25 years of experience. In *Soil Science Society of America Onsite*
630 *Wastewater Conference , Albuquerque NM, 7-8 April 2014*.
- 631 Jewell, W.J. & Seabrook, B.L., 1979. *MCD-40: A history of land application as a treatment*
632 *alternative*, Washington D.C.: U.S. Environmental Protection Agency. Office of Water
633 Program Operation.
- 634 Kardos, L.T. & Hook, J.E., 1976. Phosphorus balance in sewage effluent treated soils. *Journal*
635 *of Environmental Quality*, 1, pp.87–90.
- 636 Kovar, J.L. & Pierzynski, G.M., 2009. *Methods of Phosphorus Analysis for Soils , Sediments ,*
637 *Residuals , and Waters. Second Edition.*,
- 638 Langergraber, G., 2016. Applying Process-Based Models for Subsurface Flow Treatment
639 Wetlands: Recent Developments and Challenges. *Water*, 9(1), p.5.
- 640 Langergraber, G. & Šimůnek, J., 2012. Reactive transport modeling of subsurface flow
641 constructed wetlands using the HYDRUS Wetland Module. *Vadose Zone Journal*, 11(2).
- 642 Leonard, R.A., Knisel, W.G. & Still, D.A., 1986. GLEAMS: Groundwater Loading Effects of
643 Agricultural Management Systems. *Transaction of the ASAE*.
- 644 Lewis, J. & Sjöström, J., 2010. Optimizing the experimental design of soil columns in saturated
645 and unsaturated transport experiments. *Journal of Contaminant Hydrology*, 115(1–4),
646 pp.1–13.
- 647 Lindsay, W.L., 1980. *Chemical Equilibria in Soils*,
- 648 Liolios, K.A., Moutsopoulos, K.N. & Tsihrintzis, V.A., 2015. Numerical simulation of
649 phosphorus removal in horizontal subsurface flow constructed wetlands. *Desalination and*
650 *Water Treatment*, 56(5), pp.1282–1290.
- 651 MacBride, M.B., 1994. *Environmental Chemistry of Soils*, New York: Oxford University Press.
- 652 McCray, J.E. et al., 2009. *State of the Science : Review of Quantitative Tools to Determine*
653 *Wastewater Soil Treatment Unit Performance (WERF Report DECIR06)*, London, UK:
654 Water Environment Research Foundation, Alexandria, VA.
- 655 McGechan, M.B. & Lewis, D.R., 2002. A Review of Field Scale Phosphorus Dynamics
656 Models. *Biosystems Engineering*, 81(1), pp.3–34.
- 657 Meyer, D. et al., 2015. Modelling constructed wetlands : Scopes and aims – a comparative

658 review. *Ecological Engineering*, 80, pp.205–213.

659 Morrissey, P.J., Johnston, P.M. & Gill, L.W., 2015. The impact of on-site wastewater from
660 high density cluster developments on groundwater quality. *Journal of contaminant*
661 *hydrology*, 182, pp.36–50.

662 Moura, D.R. et al., 2011. Long-term reclaimed water application effects on phosphorus
663 leaching potential in rapid infiltration basins. *Journal of Environmental Monitoring*,
664 13(9), pp.2457–62.

665 Nair, P.S. et al., 1984. Interlaboratory comparison of a standardized phosphorus adsorption
666 procedure. *Journal of Environmental Quality*, 13(4), p.591.

667 Naseri, A.A. et al., 2011. Phosphorus transport through a saturated soil column: comparison
668 between physical modeling and HYDRUS-3D outputs. *Journal of Applied Sciences*,
669 11(5), pp.815–823.

670 Nissim, W.G. et al., 2015. Willows for the treatment of municipal wastewater: Performance
671 under different irrigation rates. *Ecological Engineering*, 81, pp.395–404.

672 Office of Research and Development U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 2002. *Onsite*
673 *wastewater treatment systems manual*. EPA/625/R-00/008,

674 Paranychianakis, N. V. et al., 2006. Treatment of wastewater with Slow Rate Systems: A
675 review of treatment processes and plant functions. *Critical Reviews in Environmental*
676 *Science and Technology*, 36(3), pp.187–259.

677 Parkhurst, B.D.L. & Appelo, C. a J., 1999. User’s Guide To PHREEQC (version 2) — a
678 Computer Program for Speciation, and Inverse Geochemical Calculations. *Exchange*
679 *Organizational Behavior Teaching Journal*, D(Version 2), p.326.

680 Parkhurst, D.L. & Appelo, C.A.J., 2011. PHREEQC forWindows.A hydrogeochemical
681 transport model. Version 2.18.00. (Available at) <http://pfw.antipodes.nl/download.html>.

682 Parkhurst, D.L. & Kipp, K.L., 2002. Parallel processing for PHAST: a three-dimensional
683 reactive-transport simulator. In pp. 711–718.

684 Parkhurst, D.L., Stollenwerk, K.G. & Colman, J. a, 2003. Reactive-Transport Simulation of
685 Phosphorus in the Sewage Plume at the Massachusetts Military Reservation, Cape Cod,
686 Massachusetts. *Water-Resources Investigations Report 03-4017*.

687 Parliamentary Office of Science and Technology, 2014. Phosphate Resources. , (PostNOTE
688 477). Available at:
689 [http://researchbriefings.parliament.uk/ResearchBriefing/Summary/POST-PN-](http://researchbriefings.parliament.uk/ResearchBriefing/Summary/POST-PN-477#fullreport)
690 [477#fullreport](http://researchbriefings.parliament.uk/ResearchBriefing/Summary/POST-PN-477#fullreport) [Accessed December 11, 2015].

691 Parton, W.J. et al., 1998. DAYCENT Its land surface submodel Description and testing.PDF. ,
692 pp.35–48.

693 Pretty, J.N. et al., 2003. Environmental costs of freshwater eutrophication in England and
694 Wales. *Environmental Science & Technology*, 37, pp.201–208.

695 Reddy, K.R. et al., 1999. Phosphorus Retention in Streams and Wetlands: A Review. *Critical*
696 *Reviews in Environmental Science and Technology*, 29(July 2015), pp.83–146.

697 Richards, S. et al., 2015. The contribution of household chemicals to environmental discharges
698 via effluents: Combining chemical and behavioural data. *Journal of Environmental*
699 *Management*, 150, pp.427–434.

- 700 Richardson, C.J., Walbridg, M.R. & Burns, A., 1988. Soil chemistry and phosphorus retention
701 capacity of North Carolina coastal plain swamps receiving rewater effluent. *UNC-WRRI-*
702 88-241. , (November).
- 703 Robertson, W.D., 2008. Irreversible phosphorus sorption in septic system plumes? *Ground*
704 *Water*, 46(1), pp.51–60.
- 705 Robertson, W.D., 2012. Phosphorus retention in a 20-year-old septic system filter bed. *Journal*
706 *of Environmental Quality*, 41(5), pp.1437–44.
- 707 Sapkota, M. et al., 2014. An overview of hybrid water supply systems in the context of urban
708 water management: challenges and opportunities. *Water*, 7(1), pp.153–174.
- 709 Šimůnek, J. & van Genuchten, M.T., 2008. Modeling Nonequilibrium Flow and Transport
710 Processes Using HYDRUS. *Vadose Zone Journal*, 7, p.782.
- 711 Sinclair, A., Jamieson, R., Madani, A., et al., 2014. A watershed modeling framework for
712 phosphorus loading from residential and agricultural sources. *Journal of Environmental*
713 *Quality*, 43(4), pp.1356–69.
- 714 Sinclair, A., Jamieson, R., Gordon, R.J., et al., 2014. Modeling phosphorus treatment capacities
715 of on-site wastewater lateral flow sand filters. *Journal of Environmental Engineering*,
716 140(2), pp.4013002–13.
- 717 Smith, J.E.J., 2006. Process Design Manual Land Treatment of Municipal Wastewater
718 Effluents. EPA/625/R-06/016. *U.S. Environmental Protection Agency*, p.193.
- 719 Smith, V.H., Joye, S.B. & Howarth, R.W., 2006. Eutrophication of freshwater and marine
720 ecosystems. *Limnol. Oceanogr*, 51(2), pp.351–355.
- 721 Sweaney, G., 2011. *The performance of sustainable wastewater treatment works solutions.*
722 *Report Ref. NO. 11/WW/04/16*,
- 723 Syers, J.K., Johnston, a. E. & Curtin, D., 2008. *Efficiency of soil and fertilizer phosphorus use*,
724 Rome: FAO Fertilizer and Plant Nutrition Bulletin 18. Food and Agriculture Organization
725 of the United Nations.
- 726 The 92nd United States Congress, 1972. Federal Water Pollution Control Act of 1972. 33
727 *U.S.C. 1251 et seq.* Available at: [http://www2.epa.gov/laws-regulations/summary-clean-](http://www2.epa.gov/laws-regulations/summary-clean-water-act)
728 [water-act](http://www2.epa.gov/laws-regulations/summary-clean-water-act) [Accessed August 18, 2015].
- 729 Twarakavi, N.K.C., Simunek, J. & Seo, S., 2008. Evaluating Interactions between
730 Groundwater and Vadose Zone Using the HYDRUS-Based Flow Package for
731 MODFLOW. *Vadose Zone Journal*, 7(2), pp.757–768.
- 732 Tzanakakis, V.E., Paranychianakis, N. V. & Angelakis, A.N., 2007. Soil as a wastewater
733 treatment system: Historical development. *Water Science and Technology: Water Supply*,
734 7(1), pp.67–75.
- 735 UK Parliament, 2010. Detergents Regulations 2010 (SI 740/2010). , pp.1–15.
- 736 Vadas, P.A., Bolster, C.H. & Good, L.W., 2013. Critical evaluation of models used to study
737 agricultural phosphorus and water quality. *Soil Use and Management*, 29(SUPPL.1),
738 pp.36–44.
- 739 Vogel, T. et al., 2015. Modeling flow and transport in a two- dimensional dual-permeability
740 system with spatially variable hydraulic properties. , 238(NOVEMBER 2000), pp.78–89.

741 Vohla, C. et al., 2011. Filter materials for phosphorus removal from wastewater in treatment
742 wetlands—A review. *Ecological Engineering*, 37(1), pp.70–89.

743 Weiss, P. et al., 2008. Environmental systems analysis of four on-site wastewater treatment
744 options. *Resources, Conservation and Recycling*, 52(10), pp.1153–1161.

745 White, P.J. & Hammond, J.P., 2002. *Updating the estimate of the sources of phosphorus in UK*
746 *waters. Defra project WT0701CSF*,

747 Xu, D. et al., 2006. Studies on the phosphorus sorption capacity of substrates used in
748 constructed wetland systems. *Chemosphere*, 63(2), pp.344–352.

749 Yu, L., 2012. *A modeling method for longevity study of infiltration for phosphorous removal*.
750 Master thesis. Royal Institute of Technology, Stockholm.

751 Zhang, T.C. et al., 2007. Phosphorus fate and transport in soil columns loaded intermittently
752 with influent of high phosphorous concentrations. *Water Environment Research*, 79(11),
753 pp.2343–2351.

754 Zhang, T.C. & Dahab, M.F., 2006. *Phosphorous sorption capacity and distributions in soil*
755 *after long-term wastewater land treatment in Muskegon, Michigan*, Kansas City: EPA.

756

757

758

759

760

761

762

763

764

765

766

767

768

769

770

771

772

773

774

775

776

777

Table 1 Comparison of Land Treatment Process Design Features. **Source:** (Smith 2006)

Feature	Slow rate (SR)	Overland flow (OF)	Rapid Infiltration (RI)
Minimum pre-treatment	Primary sedimentation	Screening	Primary sedimentation
Annual loading rate (m/yr)	0.5-6	3-20	6-125
Typical annual loading rate (m/yr)	1.5	10	30
Field area required (ha)	23-280	3.6-44	3-23
Typical weekly loading rate (cm/week)	1.9-6.5	6-40	10-240
Disposition of applied wastewater	Evaporation and percolation	Evapotranspiration surface run off, limited percolation	Mainly percolation
Application techniques	Sprinkler, surface or drip	Sprinkler or surface	Usually surface
Need of vegetation	Required	Required	Optional
Climate needs	Winter storage in cold climates	Not critical	Not critical

778

779

Table 2 Previous longevity estimations in different substrates and systems¹

Source	Substrate/type systems	Longevity (years)	Land use	Wastewater type	Soil Texture
Drizo et al. (2002)	Electric Arc Furnace (EAF) Steel slag shale	13-37	Batch experiment	Municipal wastewater	-
Dong et al. (2005)	Oyster shell	8-23	Batch experiment	-	-
Xu et al. (2006)	Furnace slag	22	Batch experiment	-	-
Hu et al. (2006)	Soil	29-49-151	Unproductive	~50% mill industry ~25% from other industries and ~25% from domestic waste- water.	Four major types of sandy soil on the site: Rubicon, Roscommon, Augers, and Granby
Heistad et al. (2006)	Filtralite®	5	Sub-surface flow CW	Domestic wastewater	-
Weiss et al. (2008)	Filtralite® Filtra P Soil	5 10 25	-	Domestic wastewater	-
Jenssen et al. (2014)	Infiltration basin	36	-	Domestic wastewater	Glaciofluvial sand and gravel deposit

780

¹ Different volumes, loading and wastewater characteristics assumptions for calculations

781

Long-term phosphorus removal in land treatment systems: Evaluation, experiences, and opportunities

Batista Segui, María del Mar

2017-04-18

Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International

Seguí MD, Hess T, Sakrabani R, Tyrrel S, Long-term phosphorus removal in land treatment systems: Evaluation, experiences, and opportunities, *Critical Reviews in Environmental Science and Technology*, Vol. 47, Issue 5, pp. 314-334

<http://dspace.lib.cranfield.ac.uk/handle/1826/12312>

Downloaded from CERES Research Repository, Cranfield University