

## HEAVY METAL COMPOSITION OF PARTICULATE MATTER IN RURAL AND URBAN RESIDENTIAL BUILT ENVIRONMENTS IN PAKISTAN

Z. A. Nasir<sup>1,2\*</sup>, I. Colbeck<sup>1</sup>, Z. Ali<sup>3</sup> and S. Ahmed<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>School of Energy, Environment and Agrifood, Cranfield University, Cranfield, Bedfordshire, MK43 0AL, UK

<sup>2</sup>School of Biological Sciences, University of Essex, Colchester, CO4 3SQ, UK

<sup>3</sup>Environmental Health and Wildlife, Department of Zoology, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

<sup>4</sup>Department of Botany, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

\*Corresponding author Email: [z.a.nasar@cranfield.ac.uk](mailto:z.a.nasar@cranfield.ac.uk)

### ABSTRACT

Heavy metals in outdoor and indoor airborne particulate matter (PM) and dust in different residential built environments at two rural and one urban site in Pakistan were analysed. An eight stage non-viable impactor (Thermo Fisher Scientific Inc., USA) loaded with EMP 2000 glass microfiber filter papers (Whatman, England) was used to collect airborne PM. The indoor dust samples (settled dust) were collected from different indoor surfaces (floor, cupboards) in living rooms and kitchens from houses at rural sites. The outdoor samples were collected from courtyards of the houses. At the urban site dust samples were also collected by the roads at 27 different locations around Lahore and at a background site (University of Veterinary and Animal Sciences). Additionally, samples of dung cake, used as solid fuel, at one of the rural sites were taken. Heavy metals (Si, Al, Zn, Mn, Cu, Ni, Cd, Pb, Co and As) were determined by Graphite Furnace Atomic Absorption Spectrophotometer. At rural site I, in general, the concentrations of metals were higher outdoors than indoors, except for slightly higher indoor levels of Cu ( $0.85 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$  indoor:  $0.56 \text{ outdoor} \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ ), Si ( $3.31 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$  indoor:  $3.17 \text{ outdoor} \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ ) and Pb ( $11.99 \text{ ng}/\text{m}^3$  indoor:  $9.32 \text{ outdoor ng}/\text{m}^3$ ). At the rural site II the mean concentration were higher outdoors than indoors, excluding Ni which was considerably higher indoors ( $55.68 \text{ ng}/\text{m}^3$ ) than outdoors ( $31.91 \text{ ng}/\text{m}^3$ ). At the urban site, outdoors, Si had the highest concentration ( $3.46 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ ) followed by Al, Zn, Mn, Cu, Ni, Cd, Pb and Co. Similarly, the indoor levels had a maximum contribution from Si ( $12.30 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ ) followed by Al, Mn, Zn, Cu, Cd, As, Pb, Ni and Co. With reference to dust at rural site I the top five metals outdoors were Si (708 mg/kg), Al, Cu, Zn and Pb (52 mg/kg) while, indoors Al was highest (281 mg/kg), followed by Si, Cu, Zn and Pb (57 mg/kg). At rural site II, both outdoors and indoors, Al (274 mg/kg – outdoor: 266 mg/kg - indoor), Si, Zn, Cu and Pb (61 mg/kg – outdoor: 80 mg/kg - indoor) were the five most abundant metals. The main five metals in decreasing order of their concentration in the road dust around Lahore were Si (686 mg/kg), Al, Cu, Zn and Pb (81 mg/kg). On the other hand, the dust samples from the background site showed Si ( $345 \text{ mg}/\text{kg}$ ) > Al > Pb > Cu > Zn (73 mg/kg). The airborne metal concentration of Pb was within the guideline value of WHO ( $0.5 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ ) but the levels of Mn, Cd and Ni were higher at all sites than the guidelines proposed by European Commission and WHO highlighting the risk of exposure to toxic metals in non-occupational environments.

**Key words:** PM, dust, metals, household fuel, rural, urban, Pakistan

### INTRODUCTION

Knowledge of indoor air quality is of vital importance to estimate the total human exposure to different air pollutants due to the high proportion of time spent in different indoor environments (Ott, 2007). Air pollutants in indoor air can have diverse sources originating from indoors as well as outdoors. The state of air quality in the residential built environment can have major public health impact due to amount of time spent in houses, particularly, by children and elderly who are disproportionately susceptible to the risks of exposure to air pollutants. There are numerous indoor and outdoor sources of air pollutants in residential environments: cooking and other combustion appliances, heating, household cleaning, smoking, use of aerosol products,

building materials, furnishing, plants/pets, human occupants, heating and cooling systems, outdoor anthropogenic sources (Industrial processes, automobile emissions) and natural sources (volcanic/soil/rock debris, sea salt, forests). The types and emission strength of these in different residential settings will vary largely across different regions depending on many socio-economic developments and air quality management capabilities.

In the developing world household use of solid fuels is the biggest source of indoor air pollution. At present 2.8 billion people still use solid fuel as household energy source, often in low efficiency traditional stoves, leading to excessive levels of indoor air pollution. The majority of these households are in low to middle income countries mainly in Asia, Africa and Latin America (WHO, 2014a). In 2012, approximately 4.3 million premature deaths were attributable to household

airpollution: mostly from low and middle income countries (WHO 2014b). Among the range of hazardous air contaminants, particulate matter (PM) is responsible for huge burden of disease in both developed and developing world (WHO, 2014a; Correia *et al.* 2013).

The PM generated by different sources can have diverse sizes, shapes as well as chemical composition. The concentration of indoor particle varies considerably and can have very complex chemical composition depending not only on their sources but also on post formation processes. The most important chemical properties of particles include: elemental composition, inorganic ions, carbonaceous compounds (organic and elemental carbon) (Morawska, 2004). Knowledge of the chemical composition of PM is of great importance in order to understand the risk associated with various components and to identify the source signatures. Indoor PM and settled dust in households, particularly, those using solid fuels and/or in urban areas with high ambient air pollution may contain sufficient quantities of such elements which pose toxicological risk to occupants. A large number of studies have highlighted that indoor dust can be an important source of metal exposure and toxic metals may accumulate in humans by way of inhalation or ingestion (Kurt-Karakus, 2012; Rasmussen *et al.* 2013). Young children have a high risk of exposure due to their various activities involving direct and indirect contact with the dust and large amount of time spent indoors (Barbieri *et al.* 2014).

A number of studies have examined the level of heavy metals, particularly, in dust from indoor and outdoor of residential built environments in different regions globally: Italy (Manno *et al.*, 2006), Malaysia (Latif *et al.*, 2009), Bahrain (Madany, 1994), Canada (Rasmussen *et al.*, 2013), Jordan (Al-Khashman, 2007), Hong Kong (Li *et al.*, 2001), China (Yang *et al.*, 2015; Huang *et al.*, 2007), Egypt (Rashed, 2008), Turkey (Kurt-Karakus, 2012; Pekey *et al.*, 2010), Oman (Abdul-Wahab, 2006), Tibet - China (Chen *et al.* 2015; Li *et al.*, 2012), Sweden (Molnár *et al.*, 2006), Mexico (Tovalin-Ahumada *et al.*, 2007), USA (Adgate *et al.*, 2007), India (Deka and Hoque, 2015). Although the vast proportion of exposure to indoor PM is due to use of solid fuels, studies on chemical characterization of smoke produced during cooking are limited. The physical and chemical characteristics of aerosols, including heavy metals, emitted during cooking with yak dung in the Tibetan Plateau has been examined by Chen *et al.* 2015; Li *et al.* 2012 and Kang *et al.* 2009. Lab based studies have also been carried out to assess the emission factors of chemical composition (OC, EC, different ionic species) from different types of biomass fuels (fuel wood, crop residue and dung cake) (Saud *et al.* 2012; 2013). Recently, Deka and Hoque (2015) characterized chemical composition (elements, anions, carbon) of the smoke

released from different biomass fuel during cooking in rural households and found that smoke from cow dung had highest level of elements, carbon and anions than other fuel types.

With reference to Pakistan, a large fraction of the population still relies on solid fuels as a household energy source. Recent estimates have shown that overall 62% of the population use solid fuels and this proportion is considerably higher in rural areas (87%) than urban households (13%). Furthermore, only 6% of households have a separate space for cooking and this trend is slightly higher in urban areas (5%) than rural (7%) (NIPS and ICF, 2013). Therefore, indoor air pollution is a growing public health challenge in Pakistan. Additionally the state of ambient air quality, especially, in urban centres is alarming due to a significant growth in number of vehicles, urbanization and industrial sector along with inefficient automotive technology, use of unclean fuels, weakly regulated industrial emissions and minimal air quality management capabilities. Pakistan Economic Survey 2013-14 has reported the number of total vehicles grew by 130.3% over the period of 2001 – 02 to 2012-13 and emissions from vehicles are the biggest source of air pollution in the country (Pakistan Economic Survey, 2013 - 2014). The reported level of PM from urban centres in the country are among the highest in the world and many times higher than WHO guidelines (Sanchez-Triana *et al.* 2014; Colbeck *et al.* 2010a). Similarly the available evidence on level of indoor air pollutants in Pakistan shows that that concentration of different air pollutants (CO, PM<sub>10</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub>, PM<sub>1</sub> and NO<sub>2</sub>) are many times higher than WHO guidelines (Nasir *et al.*, 2013; Colbeck *et al.*, 2010b,c; Siddiqui *et al.*, 2009). Several intervention efforts have been made by government and nongovernmental organisations at short scale but the issue of indoor air pollution still lags behind policy maker's agenda (Colbeck *et al.*, 2010b). Therefore, a large fraction of the population is exposed to excessive levels of PM in both rural and urban residential built environments. Several studies have been carried out on elemental composition of ambient PM in urban centres and these have been reviewed by Colbeck *et al.* 2010a. However, studies on heavy metal composition of indoor PM and settled dust from residential built environments are scanty (Nazir *et al.*, 2011; Jabeen *et al.* 2001). The present study aims to analyse the heavy metal composition of PM and settled dust from rural and urban households using different fuels.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

**Sampling Sites:** The samples were collected from both indoors (kitchens and/or living room) and outdoors (courtyards) at two sites (Rural Site I - Chak NO.35/2.L and Rural Site II - Bhaun) and an urban site

(Lahore)during August – November 2007 and June 2008. Households at rural site I used solid fuel predominantly whereas at rural site II and the urban site the fuel was natural gas. Rural site I was surrounded by agricultural lands and had very low traffic density. However, burning of solid waste/crop residue was common outdoors. On the other hand rural site II was semi urban and was close to a main road, although traffic density within the village was very low. The sampled households at the urban sites were located in densely populated areas in the main city with high traffic density. Additionally, road dust samples were also taken from 27 different sites in Lahore and at a background site (university roads at University of Veterinary and Animal Sciences Lahore). The detailed description of the sampling sites has been given in Nasir *et al.*, (2013).

**Collection of airborne PM:** AirbornePM was collected with an eight stage nonviable impactor (Thermo Fisher Scientific Inc. Waltham, MA, USA). This is a multi-stage, multi-orifice sampler and can collect particles from 9 to 0.4 $\mu$ m aerodynamic diameters at 28.3 l/min. The collection time at each site varied from 5 – 8 hours. Glass microfiber filters (EMP 2000 – Whatman England) were used as the collection medium. Samples were taken at a height of 1 meter at each sampling site/space.

**Collection of Dust Samples:** Dust samples were collected from all the sampling sites, both indoors and outdoors, and from 27 different locations on the roads and at a background site in Lahore. The indoor samples (settled dust) were collected from various indoor surfaces (floor, cupboards, etc.) in living rooms and/or kitchens from randomly selected houses at rural and urban sites. The outdoor samples were collected from randomly selected points in courtyards of the houses. The road dust samples were collected from both sides of the road, one foot away from the road edge. In all the sampling locations, the dust samples were collected by disposable plastic brushes and laminated paper pans. After collection the dust samples were packed into airtight polyethylene bags. Additionally, samples of dung were also taken. These samples were kept refrigerated before analysis. For analysis, the dust and dung samples were dried in an oven at 60°C for 72 hours and then ground to a powder with a pestle and mortar before sieving (150  $\mu$ m). These samples were then extracted for the analysis of heavy metals.

**Extraction and Analysis of Heavy Metals:** Both air and soil samples were extracted by the same method. For air samples the filter was placed in a 50 ml boiling test tube while in case of the dust 1 g (noting the weight to three significant figures) was placed in a 50 ml boiling test tube and 4 ml of 'primar' grade Nitric Acid (70%) was added. Then these were left at room temperature, covered with Decon washed marbles, for 36 hours followed by heating

in a TeckamPTC-2 digestion block in fume cupboard. At first samples were heated at 50°C for 30 minutes and then at 140 °C for 8 hours. Following digestion, the samples were left to cool and 5 ml deionised H<sub>2</sub>O was added to wash any residual solution from the test tubes and stored at room temperature. Digested samples were filtered using a glass fibre syringe filter. Finally, filtered samples were made up to 20 ml with deionised H<sub>2</sub>O. Metals in solution were determined by Graphite Furnace Atomic Absorption Spectrophotometer (Unicam atomic absorption, Cambridge, UK).

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

**Heavy Metals in AirbornePM:** The heavy metal composition of PM at the three sites (Rural I and II, Urban) is shown in Table 1. For outdoors at rural site I metal concentrations decreased in the following order: Al, Si, Zn, Mn, Cu, Ni, Cd and Pb. In the kitchens Al was again dominant followed by Si, Mn, Cu, Zn, Ni, Pb and Cd. As and Co concentrations were below the limit of detection at all sites. In general, the concentrations of trace metals were higher outdoors than indoors, except for slightly higher indoor levels of Cu, Si and Pb. At rural site II the mean concentration in the living rooms and outdoors revealed a different concentration order. Outdoors Si was dominant followed by Al, Zn, Mn, Cu, Cd, Ni and Pb (Table 1). Indoors the pattern was fairly similar: Si, Al, Zn, Mn, Cu, Ni, Cd, Pb and Co. Again As was below the detection limit in both settings (indoors and outdoors) while Co was only detectable indoors. The levels of heavy metals were higher outdoors than indoors, except for Ni which was considerably higher indoors (55.68 ng/m<sup>3</sup>) than outdoors (31.91 ng/m<sup>3</sup>). The heavy metal composition of PM at the urban site was determined in living rooms and outdoors. Si had the highest concentration outdoors followed by Al, Zn, Mn, Cu, Ni, Cd, Pb and Co. Similarly, the indoor levels had a maximum contribution from Si followed by Al, Mn, Zn, Cu, Cd, As, Pb, Ni and Co (Table 1). The Si concentrations were substantially higher indoors than outdoors. This might be due to the contribution from deposited indoor dust due to the use of a ceiling fan during the sampling because of the summer weather.

Another study in Pakistan by Naziret *al.* (2011) reported I/O relationships of trace metals in PM from an industrial area (WahCantt). Total suspended particulate matter was collected from living rooms and at the rooftop with a high volume air sampler. The indoor and outdoor concentrations of different metals at the urban site in the present study are in agreement to some extent with their findings. Both studies found higher levels of Cd and Pb indoors and Zn and CO outdoors. However, the concentration of different metals both indoors and outdoors differ largely. The level of indoor Cu (0.26  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup>), Zn (0.63  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup>) and Pb (67.33 ng/m<sup>3</sup>) at

urban site in the present study were lower than Nazir *et al.* 2011 (Cu:1.14 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ ; Zn:3.49 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$  and Pb:272.6 $\text{ng}/\text{m}^3$ ). Whereas, outdoors they reported higher concentrations of Zn(3.94  $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ ), Pb(137.4  $\text{ng}/\text{m}^3$ ), and Co(152.9  $\text{ng}/\text{m}^3$ ). With reference to other regions the concentration of heavy metals for both indoor and outdoor were generally higher in the present study than reported from China (Huang *et al.* 2007), Mexico (Tovalin-Ahumada *et al.*, 2007), USA (Adgate *et al.*, 2007) and Sweden (Molnár *et al.*, 2006) apart from Cd and Co which were higher in Mexico city. The levels of Pb were comparatively higher both indoors and outdoors in China while it was only higher outdoors in Mexico.

Studies with regard to heavy metals in indoor air from households using solid fuels are very rare. The indoor levels of Cd, As and Pb reported by Kang *et al.*, (2009) from Tibetan plateau during cooking with Yak

dung were far higher than in the present study. Their reported concentration of Cd, As and Pb during cooking time were 4.38  $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ , 48.60  $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$  and 112.11  $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ , respectively. A recent study (Li *et al.* 2012) from the same region has reported yet again higher levels for Al (16.39  $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ ), Cd (3.45  $\text{ng}/\text{m}^3$ ), Ni (157  $\text{ng}/\text{m}^3$ ), and Pb(72.79  $\text{ng}/\text{m}^3$ ) than the present study except Cu (86.79  $\text{ng}/\text{m}^3$ ) and Zn (374  $\text{ng}/\text{m}^3$ ). The comparison of the heavy metal concentration determined in present study with guideline values proposed by various agencies revealed that the concentration of Pb was within the guideline value of WHO (0.5  $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ ) but Mn was higher than the guideline value of 0.15  $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$  (WHO, 2002). The concentrations of Cd and Ni were also higher than permissible limit values by European Commission (Cd – 5 $\text{ng}/\text{m}^3$ ; Ni – 10-50  $\text{ng}/\text{m}^3$ ) (European Commission, 2000).

**Table 1. The heavy metal composition of airborne PM in Pakistan. Units of  $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$  except for Cd, Ni, Pb, As and Co which are reported in  $\text{ng}/\text{m}^3$**

Species	Rural site I		Rural site II		Urban site	
	Outdoor (n = 5)	Indoor(Kit) (n = 5)	Outdoor (n = 5)	Indoor(LR) (n = 5)	Indoor (LR) (n = 5)	Outdoor (n = 5)
Al	7.21	6.22	7.89	4.74	3.49	3.01
Cu	0.56	0.85	0.27	0.14	0.26	0.30
Mn	0.98	0.97	0.62	0.17	0.66	0.34
Si	3.17	3.31	22.31	12.65	12.30	3.46
Zn	1.36	0.76	1.01	0.93	0.63	0.85
Cd*	35.05	0.59	79.17	5.93	85.24	31.66
Ni*	151.34	69.33	31.91	55.68	13.12	65.78
Pb*	9.32	11.99	9.53	5.77	67.33	16.24
As*	ND	ND	ND	ND	72.17	ND
Co*	ND	ND	ND	3.90	0.75	12.69

\*  $\text{ng}/\text{m}^3$ , n = number of samples, ND – below limit of detection, n = number of samples. Kit: Kitchen, LR: Living Room

**Heavy metals in dust:** Table 2 shows the concentrations of heavy metals, in dust and dung. At rural site I the chemical analysis was carried out on indoor and outdoor dust. Outdoors, the top five metals with respect to their concentration in dust were Si, Al, Cu, Zn and Pb while, indoor it was dominated by Al, followed by Si, Cu, Zn and Pb (Table 2). Apart from Si the concentration of heavy metals were approximately the same indoors and outdoors. Si was considerably higher in outdoor dust. The heavy-metal composition of dung revealed that, out of the total 10 metals, Si was the leading constituent followed by Al, Cu, Zn, Pb and Ni. The remaining metals had lower concentrations. At the rural site II the sampling was carried out in outdoors and living rooms. Al, Si, Zn, Cu

and Pb were the five most abundant metals both outdoors and indoors. The dust samples at the urban site were collected from university roads (University of Veterinary and Animal Sciences, Lahore, with very limited traffic – surrounded by a large network of high traffic roads) and from the roads at 27 different locations around Lahore. The dust samples from the university showed Si > Al > Pb > Cu > Zn. On the other hand, the main five metals in decreasing order of their concentration in the road dust were Si, Al, Cu, Zn and Pb. In general, the concentrations of As, Co, Mn and Ni were approximately the same while Si, Zn, Cu and Cd were higher in road dust. In fact, Si was almost double in the city road dust than in the University road dust.

**Table2. The heavy metal composition of dust (mg/kg)**

Species	Rural site I			Rural site II		Urban site	
	Outdoor (n = 5)	Indoor (n = 5)	Dung (n = 3)	Outdoor (n = 5)	Indoor (n = 5)	University (n = 8)	By road (n = 27)
Al	281.69	281.32	272.75	274.59	266.58	282.21	273.78
As	5.34	3.47	6.81	4.60	6.17	4.92	4.26
Cd	2.11	3.32	3.63	2.78	3.17	3.44	6.31
Co	11.87	12.52	22.69	11.91	17.58	28.16	26.67
Cu	80.81	84.50	82.29	80.49	85.79	78.51	86.03
Mn	11.35	11.27	11.38	11.48	11.43	11.26	11.56
Ni	32.68	32.78	32.50	32.58	32.09	33.19	31.57
Pb	52.53	57.94	35.81	61.46	80.68	89.89	81.61
Si	708.09	212.08	280.14	253.25	141.94	345.95	686.03
Zn	79.89	80.09	81.55	85.16	82.26	73.22	83.35

n= Number of samples

The concentration of heavy metals during the present study was lower than those reported by Jabeen *et al.* (2001) during a study on the concentration of heavy metals in street and house dust in Gujranwala, an industrial city of Pakistan. This might be due to differences in the location and emission sources between these sites. The concentration of heavy metals in the present study were also lower than recently reported from house dust in a Chinese town except Cd (Yang *et al.*, 2015). Their reported concentrations for As, Cd, Pb, Cu and Mn were 31.97 ( $\mu\text{g/g}$ ), 0.56 ( $\mu\text{g/g}$ ), 300.46 ( $\mu\text{g/g}$ ), 93.44 ( $\mu\text{g/g}$ ) and 600.51 ( $\mu\text{g/g}$ ), respectively. However, the heavy metal loadings in the present study were higher than house and street dust reported from a semi urban area in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia (Latif *et al.*, 2009). A study on house dust from Istanbul, Turkey had a higher concentration of Cu (156  $\mu\text{g/g}$ ), Zn (832  $\mu\text{g/g}$ ), Mn (136  $\mu\text{g/g}$ ), and Nickel (263  $\mu\text{g/g}$ ) than present study while Pb (28  $\mu\text{g/g}$ ), Cd (0.8  $\mu\text{g/g}$ ) and Co (5  $\mu\text{g/g}$ ) were lower (Kurt-Karakus, 2012). Recently, Faizet *et al.* (2009) presented an analysis of road dust (Cd, Cu, Ni, Pb and Zn) along the Islamabad Expressway. Their reported levels of Cu (52 mg/kg) and Ni (23 mg/kg) were lower than in the road dust from Lahore city. They found a moderately higher load of Pb (104 mg/kg) and Zn (116 mg/kg) as compared to road dust in Lahore (Table 2). They also found that the concentration of heavy metals in road dust of Islamabad Highway were towards the lower end of reported levels from different parts of the world. The concentrations of most heavy metals found in this study were lower than those reported from other regions of the world in recent studies. For example concentrations of Pb, Zn, Ni, and As in road dust in a Greece town were 359 ( $\mu\text{g/g}$ ), 137.8 ( $\mu\text{g/g}$ ), 58.2 ( $\mu\text{g/g}$ ), and 62.3 ( $\mu\text{g/g}$ ), respectively, and only Cd (0.2  $\mu\text{g/g}$ ) and Cu (42.7  $\mu\text{g/g}$ ) were lower than current study (Christoforidis and Stamatis, 2009). However, it is likely that the concentration of toxic metals, particularly, in urban centres with high traffic density will increase due

to ever growing number of vehicles with inefficient automotive technology and poor vehicle emission regulation implementation.

**Conclusions:** The current study analysed the level of heavy metal in airborne PM and dust from two rural and one urban site in Pakistan. A large variation in concentration distribution of heavy metal in both airborne PM and dust in outdoors and indoors was found. Overall, the levels of toxic metals were higher than safe limits proposed by WHO and these were almost equal or higher in rural areas using solid fuels than the urban centre. Hence both rural and urban households are under the severe threat of poor air quality and may be equally exposed to excessive levels of toxic metals. This can have significant implications for vulnerable groups (elderly, children, pregnant women) and public health in general. The main sources of heavy metals in rural areas were use of solid fuels, indoor smoking and burning of solid waste while at the urban site vehicular and industrial emissions were additional sources highlighting venue and scenario specific risk of exposure to toxic metals. At present both indoor and ambient air quality in Pakistan is among the worst in the world and calls for urgent intervention strategies in rural areas to improve indoor air quality in households relying on solid fuels. Additionally strict implementation of legislative measures to regulate industrial and vehicular emission along with enhancement of air quality management system and transportation infrastructure in the country is required. This study was carried out only at two rural sites and one urban site and may not reflect the levels of exposure to toxic metal at the country level. Nonetheless the findings contribute to the existing state of knowledge on toxic metal emissions from household fuels in Pakistan and are of relevance to other countries/regions with predominate solid fuel use as an household energy source. Further studies from different regions are needed to gain a comprehensive understanding about the extent of heavy

metal exposure in residential built environment with solid fuel use.

## REFERENCES

- Abdul-Wahab, S. A. (2006). Indoor and outdoor relationships of atmospheric particulates in Oman. *Indoor Built Environ.* 15(3): 247-255.
- Adgate, J. L., S. J. Mongin, G. C. Pratt, J. Zhang, M. P. Field, G. Ramachandran, and K. Sexton (2007). Relationships between personal, indoor, and outdoor exposures to trace elements in PM 2.5. *Sci. Total Environ.* 386 (1): 21-32.
- Al-Khashman, O. A. (2007). The investigation of metal concentrations in street dust samples in Aqaba city, Jordan. *Environ. Geochem. Health.* 29(3): 197-207.
- Barbieri, E., F. E. Fontúrbel, C. Herbas, F. L. Barbieri and J. Gardon (2014). Indoor metallic pollution and children exposure in a mining city. *Sci. Total Environ.* 487: 13-19.
- Chen, P., S. Kang, J. Bai, M. Sillanpää and C. Li (2015). Yak dung combustion aerosols in the Tibetan Plateau: Chemical characteristics and influence on the local atmospheric environment, *Atmos. Res.* 156: 58-66.
- Christoforidis, A. and N. Stamatis (2009). Heavy metal contamination in street dust and roadside soil along the major national road in Kavala's region, Greece. *Geoderma.* 151(3): 257-263.
- Colbeck, I., Z. A. Nasir and Z. Ali (2010a). The state of indoor air quality in Pakistan—a review. *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.* 17(6): 1187-1196.
- Colbeck, I., Z. A. Nasir and Z. Ali. (2010b). The state of ambient air quality in Pakistan—a review, *Environ. Sci. Poll. Res.* 17(1): 49-63.
- Colbeck, I., Z. Nasir and Z. Ali (2010c). Characteristics of indoor/outdoor particulate pollution in urban and rural residential environment of Pakistan. *Indoor Air.* 20(1): 40-51.
- Correia, A. W., C. A. Pope III, D. W. Dockery, Y. Wang, M. Ezzati and F. Dominici (2013). The effect of air pollution control on life expectancy in the United States: an analysis of 545 US counties for the period 2000 to 2007. *Epidemiology.* 24(1): 23-31.
- Deka, P. and R. R. Hoque (2015). Chemical characterization of biomass fuel smoke particles of rural kitchens of South Asia. *Atmos. Environ.* 108: 125-132.
- European Commission. (2000). Ambient air pollution by AS, Cd and Ni compounds. Position Paper. Office for official publications of the European Communities. Luxembourg. ISBN 92-894-2054-5.
- Faiz, Y., M.T. Javed, A. Farooq, N. Siddique, M.M. Chaudhry and K. Waheed (2009). Determination of heavy metals concentrations in dust on Islamabad Highway. *The Nucleus.* 46 (3): 225-229.
- Huang, H., S.-c. Lee, J.-j. Cao, C.-w. Zou, X.-g. Chen, and S.-j. Fan (2007). Characteristics of indoor/outdoor PM 2.5 and elemental components in generic urban, roadside and industrial plant areas of Guangzhou City, China. *J. Environ. Sci.* 19(1): 35-43.
- Jabeen, N., S. Ahmed, S. Hassan and N. Alam (2001). Levels and sources of heavy metals in house dust. *J. Radioanal. Nucl. Chem.* 247(1): 145-149.
- Kang, S., C. Li, F. Wang, Q. Zhang and Z. Cong (2009). Total suspended particulate matter and toxic elements indoors during cooking with yak dung. *Atmos. Environ.* 43(27): 4243-4246.
- Kurt-Karakus, P. B. (2012). Determination of heavy metals in indoor dust from Istanbul, Turkey: estimation of the health risk. *Environ. Int.* 50: 47-55.
- Latif, M. T., M. R. Othman, C. L. Kim, S. A. Murayadi and K. N. A. Sahaimi (2009). Composition of household dust in semi-urban areas in Malaysia. *Indoor Built Environ.* 18(2): 155-161.
- Li, C., S. Kang, P. Chen, Q. Zhang and G. C. Fang. (2012). Characterizations of particle-bound trace metals and polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) within Tibetan tents of south Tibetan Plateau, China. *Environ. Sci. Poll. Res.* 19(5): 1620-1628.
- Li, X., C.S. Poon and P. S. Liu (2001). Heavy metal contamination of urban soils and street dusts in Hong Kong, *Appl. Geochem.* 16(11): 1361-1368.
- Madany, I. M., M. S. Akhter and O. Al Jowder (1994). The correlations between heavy metals in residential indoor dust and outdoor street dust in Bahrain. *Environ. Int.* 20(4): 483-492.
- Manno, E., D. Varrica and G. Dongarra (2006). Metal distribution in road dust samples collected in an urban area close to a petrochemical plant at Gela, Sicily, *Atmos. Environ.* 40(30): 5929-5941.
- Molnár, P., S. Johannesson, J. Boman, L. Barregård and G. Sällsten (2006). Personal exposures and indoor, residential outdoor, and urban background levels of fine particle trace elements in the general population. *J. Environ. Monit.* 8(5): 543-551.
- Morawska, L. (2004). Indoor particles combustion products and fibres. In; *The hand book of environmental chemistry.* 4 part-F Indoor air

- pollution (Ed.-Pluschke, P.) Springer- Verlag Berlin Heidelberg.
- Nasir, Z. A., I. Colbeck, Z. Ali and S. Ahmad (2013). Indoor particulate matter in developing countries: a case study in Pakistan and potential intervention strategies. *Env. Res. Lett.* 8(2): 024002.
- Nazir, R., N. Shaheen and M. H. Shah. (2011). Indoor/outdoor relationship of trace metals in the atmospheric particulate matter of an industrial area. *Atmos. Res.* 101(3): 765-772.
- NIPS and ICF. (2013). Pakistan Demographic Health Survey 2012-13. National Institute of Population Studies (NIPS) [Pakistan] and ICF International. Islamabad, Pakistan, and Calverton, Maryland, USA: NIPS and ICF International. Available at: <https://dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/FR290/FR290.pdf>
- Ott, W.R. (2007). Mathematical modelling of indoor air quality. In *Exposure analysis* (Eds.) Ott, et al. 2007. CRC Press ,Taylorand Francis group. 6000 Broken Sound Parkway NW, Suite 300.
- Pakistan Economic Survey. (2013 - 2014). Environment. Pakistan Economic Survey. 2013-2014. Ministry of Finance. Government of Pakistan. Available at:[http://www.finance.gov.pk/survey/chapters\\_14/16\\_Environment.pdf](http://www.finance.gov.pk/survey/chapters_14/16_Environment.pdf)
- Pekey, B., Z. Bozkurt, H. Pekey, G. Do an, A. Zararsız, N. Efe and G. Tuncel (2010). Indoor/outdoor concentrations and elemental composition of PM10/PM2.5 in urban/industrial areas of Kocaeli City, Turkey. *Indoor Air.* 20(2): 112-125.
- Rashed, M. N. (2008). Total and extractable heavy metals in indoor, outdoor and street dust from Aswan City, Egypt. *Clean.* 36(10-11): 850-857.
- Rasmussen, P. E., C. Levesque, M. Chénier, H. D. Gardner, H. Jones-Otazo and S. Petrovic (2013). Canadian House Dust Study: Population-based concentrations, loads and loading rates of arsenic, cadmium, chromium, copper, nickel, lead, and zinc inside urban homes. *Sci. Total Environ.* 443: 520-529.
- Sanchez-Triana, E., S. Enriquez, J. Afzal, A. Nakagawa and A. S. Khan. (2014): *Cleaning Pakistan's Air: Policy Options to Address the Cost of Outdoor Air Pollution.* World Bank. Washington, DC. doi:10.1596/978-1-4648-0235-5.
- Saud, T., M. Saxena, D. Singh, M. Dahiya, S. Sharma, A. Datta, R. Gadi and T. Mandal. (2013). Spatial variation of chemical constituents from the burning of commonly used biomass fuels in rural areas of the Indo-Gangetic Plain (IGP), India. *Atmos. Environ.* 71: 158-169.
- Saud, T., R. Gautam, T. Mandal, R. Gadi, D. Singh, S. Sharma, M. Dahiya and M. Saxena. (2012). Emission estimates of organic and elemental carbon from household biomass fuel used over the Indo-Gangetic Plain (IGP), India. *Atmos. Environ.* 61: 212-220.
- Siddiqui, A., K. Lee, D. Bennett, X. Yang, K. Brown, Z. Bhutta and E. Gold (2009). Indoor carbon monoxide and PM2.5 concentrations by cooking fuels in Pakistan. *Indoor Air.* 19(1): 75-82.
- Tovalin-Ahumada, H., L. Whitehead and S. Blanco. (2007). Personal exposure to PM 2.5 and element composition—A comparison between outdoor and indoor workers from two Mexican cities. *Atmos. Environ.* 41(35): 7401-7413.
- WHO. (2002). *Air quality guidelines for Europe.* Second edition .WHO regional publications. European series; No. 91. Regional Office for Europe Scherfigsvej 8, DK-2100 Copenhagen O, Denmark.
- WHO. (2014a). *WHO indoor air quality guidelines: household fuel combustion.* WHO Press, World Health Organization, 20 Avenue Appia, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland. Available at: [http://www.who.int/indoorair/guidelines/hhfc/HFC\\_guidelines.pdf](http://www.who.int/indoorair/guidelines/hhfc/HFC_guidelines.pdf)
- WHO. (2014b). *Burden of disease from Household Air Pollution for 2012.* Public Health, Social and Environmental Determinants of Health Department, World Health Organization, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland. Available at:[http://www.who.int/phe/health\\_topics/outdoorair/databases/HAP\\_BoD\\_results\\_March2014.pdf?ua=1](http://www.who.int/phe/health_topics/outdoorair/databases/HAP_BoD_results_March2014.pdf?ua=1)
- Yang, Q., H. Chen and B. Li (2015). Source identification and health risk assessment of metals in indoor dust in the vicinity of Phosphorus mining, Guizhou Province, China. *Arch. Environ. Contam. Toxicol.* 68(1): 20-30.